

Educational System Guidelines

Course-Instructor Tier

The following guidelines are intended to aid in the continual improvement of educational systems. The underlying framework for these guidelines asserts that there are at least three tiers that impact student learning and development: 1) [Learners](#), 2) [Courses-Instructors](#), and 3) the [Educational Organization](#) in part or as a whole. In order to improve the quality of education, we must work with each of these three tiers and a series of guidelines have therefore been developed for them. These guidelines may be used for such endeavors as developing objectives for educational development interventions, conducting system-wide assessments, providing feedback to specific entities within the institution, et cetera. There are detailed explanations that accompany these. We have also compile numerous statistics and citations that support each of these guidelines.

The particular guidelines below focus on courses and instructor competencies in relation to current evidence-based educational literature. Overall, the general assertion is that the higher the Level of Development that a course/instructor competency is for each of the guidelines below, the greater the likelihood of improved student learning and development. These guidelines are therefore intended to provide insights into the areas that educational/faculty developers can focus on with courses and instructors as we work to have a positive influence on learners and the educational systems that impact their learning and development.

If this form is being used for course/instructor assessment and/or feedback, please note the following information:

Course(s)/ Instructor(s) being considered: _____

Date: _____ **Reviewer(s):** _____

If this form is being used for course assessment purposes, it may be used for either the class as a whole or for specific weeks, modules, units, etc. within the class. Please mark one of the following:

☐ Entire Course

☐ Week/Module/Unit Level: _____

Prepared by: Eric J. Kyle

Feedback Table - Objectives

Guideline	Levels of Development			N/O	Suggested Educated Citizen Focus Area(s)
	Level 3	Level 2	Level 1		
<p>1) Objectives describe observable and measurable levels of proficiency that are aligned with accreditation, institutional, and/or discipline-specific standards</p> <p>(Core Guideline)</p>	<p><input type="checkbox"/> The instructor collaborates with learners and external resources in identifying personalized learning objectives to reach long term goals that align with accreditation, institutional, and/or discipline-specific standards and are relevant for learners' professional, civic, and/or personal life.</p> <p><input type="checkbox"/> Learners are able to articulate the learning objectives in their own words and can describe how the activities in the course relate to these objectives.</p>	<p><input type="checkbox"/> While retaining alignment with accreditation, institutional, and/or discipline-specific standards, the instructor refines learning objectives based on current students' professional, civic, and/or personal lives.</p> <p><input type="checkbox"/> The instructor clearly communicates/ presents learning objectives and effectively supports learners' sustained attention on the objectives.</p>	<p><input type="checkbox"/> The instructor uses given accreditation, institutional, and/or discipline-specific standards to develop measurable learning objectives.</p> <p><input type="checkbox"/> The instructor refers to course/module objectives in general ways.</p>	<p><input type="checkbox"/></p>	<p><i>Instructor Foci:</i> -Communication -Intercultural Competency</p> <p><i>Learner Foci:</i> (see Learner Tier) -Critical Thinking</p>
<p><u>General Comments/Recommendations:</u> [Be sure to include concrete details to support your statements. Following best practices for feedback, comments should be: a) positive; b) related to specific criteria above, and c) provide suggestions for how to improve (even for Level 3 development).]</p>					

N/O – Not Observed; KSAs* - Knowledge, Skills, and/or Attitudes;

Feedback Table - Assessments

Guideline	Levels of Development			N/O	Suggested Educated Citizen Focus Area(s)
	Level 3	Level 2	Level 1		
<p>1) The course utilizes varied assessments (e.g., formative and summative, formal and informal) to establish learners' levels of proficiencies in relation to the stated course objectives as well as to guide the course's development</p> <p>(Core Guideline)</p>	<p><input type="checkbox"/> The instructor works with colleagues and learners to select and analyze a variety of assessments that will help them to better understand what is influencing learner progress.</p> <p><input type="checkbox"/> The instructor and learners then use this data to help scaffold individual learner development towards the learning objectives.</p>	<p><input type="checkbox"/> Based on Level 1 data, the instructor uses this information to adjust instruction in real-time as the course unfolds to provide additional and/or alternative supports for current learners.</p>	<p><input type="checkbox"/> The instructor uses multiple types of assessments to draw conclusions about learner progress towards the learning objectives.</p>	<p><input type="checkbox"/></p>	<p><i>Instructor Foci:</i> -Critical Thinking -Holism</p> <p><i>Learner Foci:</i> (see Learner Tier) -Critical Thinking -Holism</p>
<p>2) Feedback to learners is: a) positive, b) related to specific objectives and criteria, c) provides suggestions for how learners can continue to progress, and d) are conducted in a "timely" manner, providing learners with feedback that can be implemented in subsequent activities</p> <p>(Core Guideline)</p>	<p><input type="checkbox"/> Extending Level 2, the instructor works with learners to build self-regulated learning skills, helping them to use feedback to reflect on their own performance and to then develop and apply concrete strategies for how they will continue to improve in the course.</p>	<p><input type="checkbox"/> In addition to meeting Level 1, the instructor then designs learning experiences that will help learners to apply this feedback and thereby improve their competencies.</p>	<p><input type="checkbox"/> Using objective-generated criteria, the instructor points out strengths and weaknesses in performance and offers positive and concrete suggestions for how learners can improve their work on subsequent assignments.</p>	<p><input type="checkbox"/></p>	<p><i>Instructor Foci:</i> -Communication</p> <p><i>Learner Foci:</i> (see Learner Tier) -Critical Thinking -Holism</p>

Guideline	Levels of Development			N/O	Suggested Educated Citizen Focus Area(s)
	Level 3	Level 2	Level 1		
3) Assessments are utilized in accordance with evidence-based recommendations and, whenever possible, their reliability and validity is established	<input type="checkbox"/> The instructor collaborates with learners and/or others to engage in Level 1 & 2 activities.	<input type="checkbox"/> The instructor works to minimize bias for specific evidence-based assessments and to establish their validity and reliability based on course data.	<input type="checkbox"/> The instructor follows evidence-based recommendations for developing, implementing, interpreting, and applying specific assessments.	<input type="checkbox"/>	<i>Instructor Foci:</i> -Critical Thinking -Intercultural Competency <i>Learner Foci:</i> (see Learner Tier) -Critical Thinking
4) When appropriate, self-and/or peer-assessments and reflections are utilized that are intended to lead to improved learning and development	<input type="checkbox"/> The instructor and learners work collaboratively to generate assessment criteria. The course then helps to build learners' self-regulated learning skills by guiding them in analyzing and applying the results of self-and/or peer-assessment data to improve their performance.	<input type="checkbox"/> Building on Level 1, the instructor helps learners to apply the results of self-and/or peer-assessments in order to strengthen their performance.	<input type="checkbox"/> The instructor provides learners with criteria for an assignment to guide performance. The instructor then assists each learner in examining their own and/or each other's work in relation to these criteria.	<input type="checkbox"/>	<i>Instructor Foci:</i> -Critical Thinking -Communication <i>Learner Foci:</i> (see Learner Tier) -Critical Thinking
General Comments/Recommendations: [Be sure to include concrete details to support your statements. Following best practices for feedback, comments should be: a) positive; b) related to specific criteria above, and c) provide suggestions for how to improve (even for Level 3 development).]					

N/O – Not Observed; KSAs* - Knowledge, Skills, and/or Attitudes;

Feedback Table - Activities, Organization, & Resources

Guideline	Levels of Development			N/O	Suggested Educated Citizen Focus Area(s)
	Level 3	Level 2	Level 1		
<p>1) Activities and resources intentionally foster learner-learner interactions</p> <p>(Core Guideline)</p>	<p><input type="checkbox"/> Building on Level 2, the course facilitates long-term group projects/ activities where groups are required to collaborate in substantive ways (e.g., decision-making, problem solving, exploration, invention, etc.).</p>	<p><input type="checkbox"/> The course facilitates students learning about each other's diverse perspectives, critically reflecting on these, and/or helping one another to engage with relevant KSAs* in improved ways.</p>	<p><input type="checkbox"/> The course intentionally structures simple interactions among learners to support learning and development.</p>	<p><input type="checkbox"/></p>	<p><i>Instructor Foci:</i> -Intercultural Competency</p> <p><i>Learner Foci:</i> (see Learner Tier) -Intercultural Competency -Communication</p>
<p>2) Activities and resources help learners to progress in higher order thinking to improve learning and development</p> <p>(Core Guideline)</p>	<p><input type="checkbox"/> The course helps learners to design and implement higher order thinking experiences that are aligned with learning objectives, result in a variety of outcomes and artifacts, and that build on learners' interests and backgrounds.</p>	<p><input type="checkbox"/> The course facilitates more complex higher order thinking skills (e.g., synthesizing, creating, innovating, etc.) and/or guides learners in challenging assumptions inherent in concepts, skills, materials, theories, methods, activities, etc.</p>	<p><input type="checkbox"/> The course guides learner engagement with simpler critical thinking skills (e.g., apply, analyze, and evaluate) for course KSAs*.</p>	<p><input type="checkbox"/></p>	<p><i>Instructor Foci:</i> -Critical Thinking</p> <p><i>Learner Foci:</i> (see Learner Tier) -Critical Thinking</p>
<p>3) Course intentionally integrates relevant and interactive technologies to improve learning and development</p>	<p><input type="checkbox"/> The instructor collaborates with learners in identifying relevant interactive technologies that redefine course activities in significant ways. The technologies are essential in order to engage in learning experiences and advanced technical skills may also be required.</p>	<p><input type="checkbox"/> The course expands the options for learners' responsible use of relevant and more interactive technologies to improve learning. The technologies are integral to engagement with learning experiences and intermediate technical skills may also be required of the learner.</p>	<p><input type="checkbox"/> The course provides opportunities for learners to use relevant technologies in simpler ways that support but do not fundamentally change the learning experiences. Only very basic technology skills are needed by learners.</p>	<p><input type="checkbox"/></p>	<p><i>Instructor Foci:</i> -Holism</p> <p><i>Learner Foci:</i> (see Learner Tier) -Holism</p>

Guideline	Levels of Development			N/O	Suggested Educated Citizen Focus Area(s)
	Level 3	Level 2	Level 1		
4) <i>The course helps learners to adapt relevant KSAs* to address real-world issues in authentic contexts</i>	<input type="checkbox"/> The course helps learners to identify a real-world problem or issue in an authentic context/scenario that requires relevant KSA* adaptations and requires them to carry out a plan to directly address this issue.	<input type="checkbox"/> The course guides learners in adapting relevant KSAs* for authentic contexts/scenarios in order to address a given real-world problem or issue.	<input type="checkbox"/> The course engages learners in applying course KSAs* in authentic contexts/scenarios in direct and unmodified ways.	<input type="checkbox"/>	<i>Instructor Foci:</i> -Holism -Civic Engagement <i>Learner Foci:</i> (see Learner Tier) -Critical Thinking -Holism -Civic Engagement
5) <i>The course has learners engage in activities in ways that consistently scaffolds their increasing competencies for key KSAs*</i> (Core Guideline)	<input type="checkbox"/> The instructor works with learners to identify sustained and varied pathways in the development of key course KSAs* using a range of resources, learning experiences, and ways of demonstrating scaffolded progress towards these relevant KSAs*.	<input type="checkbox"/> The instructor plans a variety of sequenced resources and learning experiences that scaffolds competency in key course KSAs* and are matched to the experiences, needs, and interests of learners and allow for learner choice.	<input type="checkbox"/> Learners are clearly and intentionally guided through activities across the course that has them repeatedly engage key KSAs* and scaffolds their growing competencies in these areas (i.e., ensures achievement before moving on to new KSAs*).	<input type="checkbox"/>	<i>Instructor Foci:</i> -Critical Thinking -Holism -Intercultural Competency <i>Learner Foci:</i> (see Learner Tier) -Critical Thinking -Holism
6) Mission-Centered Focus: <i>The class environment is one that is experienced by learners to be safe, inclusive, and caring</i>	<input type="checkbox"/> Building on Level 2, the instructor collaborates with learners in developing and applying expectations for a learning climate that includes openness, mutual respect, and positive peer relationships in the course.	<input type="checkbox"/> In addition to Level 1, the course has activities and assessments that require respectful interaction, mutual support, and individual/group responsibility for the class environment.	<input type="checkbox"/> The course has explicit expectations for a safe and positive learning environment and there is evidence of behavior that includes respect and caring for one another.	<input type="checkbox"/>	<i>Instructor Foci:</i> -Intercultural Comp. -Communication <i>Learner Foci:</i> (see Learner Tier) -Intercultural Comp. -Communication
General Comments/Recommendations: [Be sure to include concrete details to support your statements. Following best practices for feedback, comments should be: a) positive; b) related to specific criteria above, and c) provide suggestions for how to improve (even for Level 3 development).]					

N/O – Not Observed; KSAs* - Knowledge, Skills, and/or Attitudes;

Feedback Table - Teaching & Learning Theories

Guideline	Levels of Development			N/O	Suggested Educated Citizen Focus Area(s)
	Level 3	Level 2	Level 1		
<p>1) Instructor is able to articulate: a) specific and holistic teaching and learning theories that they might utilize; and b) when and how these theories might apply</p> <p>(Core Guideline)</p>	<p><input type="checkbox"/> Recognizing that students learn and develop in diverse ways, and building on Level 2, the instructor collaborates with others to develop and utilize multiple evidence-based holistic teaching and learning theories to help guide course development. They are also able to articulate when and how each theory is being utilized.</p>	<p><input type="checkbox"/> The instructor uses observations of students as well as evidence-based resources to inform their own holistic teaching and learning theories. Based upon this information, they adjust their course.</p>	<p><input type="checkbox"/> The instructor is able to articulate their own understanding of holistic student learning and development and seeks to adjust the course's teaching strategies in light of these understandings.</p>	<p><input type="checkbox"/></p>	<p><i>Instructor Foci:</i> -Critical Thinking -Communication -Holism</p> <p><i>Learner Foci:</i> (see Learner Tier) -Critical Thinking -Communication -Holism</p>
<p>2) Course utilizes active teaching and learning strategies</p> <p>(Core Guideline)</p>	<p><input type="checkbox"/> Recognizing that students learn and develop in diverse ways, the instructor collaborates with learners and others in utilizing multiple evidence-based active teaching & learning strategies to help guide course development.</p> <p><input type="checkbox"/> The instructor empowers learners to choose and/or develop their own active ways of engaging with course KSAs* and ensures that these varied pathways align with course objectives.</p>	<p><input type="checkbox"/> The instructor utilizes one or more evidence-based active teaching & learning strategies and is able to articulate how they have adapted these strategies for the current course.</p>	<p><input type="checkbox"/> Drawing on specific active teaching & learning strategies, the instructor seeks to apply these to the course.</p>	<p><input type="checkbox"/></p>	<p><i>Instructor Foci:</i> -Critical Thinking -Intercultural Competency</p> <p><i>Learner Foci:</i> (see Learner Tier) -Critical Thinking</p>

Guideline	Levels of Development			N/O	Suggested Educated Citizen Focus Area(s)
	Level 3	Level 2	Level 1		
<p>3) Instructor is able to demonstrate the processes/methods by which they develop their course and there is alignment among course elements</p> <p>(Core Guideline)</p>	<p><input type="checkbox"/> The instructor collaborates with learners, colleagues, and external sources to engage in evidence-based course development.</p> <p><input type="checkbox"/> There is direct alignment among course as well as module/unit/weekly objectives, activities, assessments, teaching and learning theories, and learner background considerations.</p>	<p><input type="checkbox"/> The instructor draws from evidence-based literature and data to support course development (e.g., design, implementation, and evaluation).</p> <p><input type="checkbox"/> There is direct alignment among course as well as module/unit/weekly objectives, activities, and assessments.</p>	<p><input type="checkbox"/> The instructor follows some process to design, implement, and evaluate the course.</p> <p><input type="checkbox"/> There is direct alignment among the course's objectives, activities, assessments.</p>	<p><input type="checkbox"/></p>	<p><i>Instructor Foci:</i></p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> -Critical Thinking -Holism <p><i>Learner Foci: (see Learner Tier)</i></p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> -Critical Thinking -Holism
<p><u>General Comments/Recommendations:</u> [Be sure to include concrete details to support your statements. Following best practices for feedback, comments should be: a) positive; b) related to specific criteria above, and c) provide suggestions for how to improve (even for Level 3 development).]</p>					

N/O – Not Observed; KSAs* - Knowledge, Skills, and/or Attitudes;

Feedback Table - *Learner Background Considerations*

Guideline	Levels of Development			N/O	Suggested Educated Citizen Focus Area(s)
	Level 3	Level 2	Level 1		
<p>1) <i>Course is adapted to learners' relevant prior knowledge, interests, skills, and capabilities and ADA considerations are addressed</i></p> <p>(Core Guideline)</p>	<p><input type="checkbox"/> The instructor collaborates with learners in adapting multiple course objectives, activities, resources, and/or assessments to build upon learners' relevant prior knowledge, interests, skills, and capabilities.</p> <p><input type="checkbox"/> The instructor collaborates with learners and colleagues to expand the range of ADA resources that enables all learners to exceed high standards.</p>	<p><input type="checkbox"/> In light of learners' relevant prior knowledge, interests, skills, and capabilities, the instructor plans multiple learning experiences and assessments that allow for learner choice in pursuing and demonstrating their achievement of course objectives.</p> <p><input type="checkbox"/> The instructor adapts instruction and uses modified ADA resources to address the learning needs of all current learners in the course.</p>	<p><input type="checkbox"/> Drawing on past experiences and/or external resources, the instructor seeks to adjust the course appropriately to meet the diverse prior knowledge, interests, skills, and capabilities of learners.</p> <p><input type="checkbox"/> The instructor applies interventions, modifications, and accommodations based on ADA requirements.</p>	<p><input type="checkbox"/></p>	<p><i>Instructor Foci:</i> -Critical Thinking -Intercultural Competency</p> <p><i>Learner Foci:</i> (see Learner Tier) -Critical Thinking -Holism</p>
<p>2) <i>Instructor is able to appropriately modify the course in light of learners' diverse cultural locations (e.g., SES, ethnicity, gender, age, etc.)</i></p>	<p><input type="checkbox"/> The instructor collaborates with learners to develop course elements and provide different culturally appropriate pathways to engaging with the course.</p> <p><input type="checkbox"/> The instructor collaborates with a broad range of colleagues, specialists, and/or community members to understand and address learners' cultural needs and to integrate diverse cultural resources, practices, and perspectives into the class.</p>	<p><input type="checkbox"/> In light of learners' relevant cultural locations (e.g., SES, ethnicity, gender, age, etc.), the instructor plans multiple culturally appropriate pathways of learning experiences and assessments that allow for learner choice in pursuing and demonstrating their achievement of course objectives.</p>	<p><input type="checkbox"/> The instructor accesses resources to expand their understanding of the SES, ethnic, gender, age, etc. differences among learners and their communities and then modifies the course in light of this.</p>	<p><input type="checkbox"/></p>	<p><i>Instructor Foci:</i> -Critical Thinking -Intercultural Competency</p> <p><i>Learner Foci:</i> (see Learner Tier) -Critical Thinking -Intercultural Competency</p>

Guideline	Levels of Development			N/O	Suggested Educated Citizen Focus Area(s)
	Level 3	Level 2	Level 1		
<p>3) Mission-Centered Focus: <i>In pursuit of learning objectives, the course engages learners in diverse cultural experiences with under-represented and marginalized communities that proactively reduce biases and increase justice for these populations</i></p> <p>(Core Guideline)</p>	<p><input type="checkbox"/> In alignment with learning objectives, the course has activities that facilitate learners' development of advanced intercultural and civic engagement competencies, particularly with under-represented and marginalized communities.</p> <p><input type="checkbox"/> The course provides opportunities for learners to proactively work for equity and justice in solidarity with under-represented and marginalized communities.</p>	<p><input type="checkbox"/> In pursuit of learning objectives, the course has learning experiences that facilitate learners' direct engagement with diverse people from under-represented and marginalized populations.</p> <p><input type="checkbox"/> The instructor assists learners in exploring how their own biases can affect perceptions and actions, particularly as these biases relate to under-represented and marginalized communities.</p>	<p><input type="checkbox"/> The course includes multiple cultural perspectives and experiences of under-represented and marginalized communities that align with course objectives.</p> <p><input type="checkbox"/> The instructor explores how their own personal biases can affect perceptions and actions, particularly as these biases relate to under-represented and marginalized communities.</p>	<p><input type="checkbox"/></p>	<p><i>Instructor Foci:</i></p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> -Civic Engagement -Intercultural Competency <p><i>Learner Foci: (see Learner Tier)</i></p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> -Civic Engagement -Intercultural Competency
<p>General Comments/Recommendations: [Be sure to include concrete details to support your statements. Following best practices for feedback, comments should be: a) positive; b) related to specific criteria above, and c) provide suggestions for how to improve (even for Level 3 development).]</p>					

N/O – Not Observed; KSAs* - Knowledge, Skills, and/or Attitudes;

Feedback Table – Professional Development, Leadership, & Evidence-Based Practice (adapted from InTASC Standards)

Guideline	Levels of Development			N/O	Suggested Educated Citizen Focus Area(s)
	Level 3	Level 2	Level 1		
<p>1) <i>Instructor engages in and supports professional development opportunities related to improving their educational competencies</i></p> <p>(Core Guideline)</p>	<input type="checkbox"/> In addition to Level 2, the instructor collaborates with colleagues to collectively create, reflect upon, analyze, and improve professional development opportunities that address Levels 1 and/or 2.	<input type="checkbox"/> Based on personal reflections and feedback from students, peers, and mentors, the instructor identifies areas of ongoing professional development and participates in learning experiences that address these identified areas of educational improvement .	<input type="checkbox"/> The instructor engages in structured individual and/or group professional learning opportunities that help them to stay current with essential KSAs* in their discipline as well as to provide all learners with effective curriculum and learning experiences .	<input type="checkbox"/>	<p><i>Instructor Foci:</i></p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> -Critical Thinking -Holism <p><i>Learner Foci:</i> (see Learner Tier)</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> -Critical Thinking -Holism
<p>2) <i>Instructor actively participates in leadership roles and responsibilities that improve the institution's education and culture</i></p>	<input type="checkbox"/> The instructor is a leader in identifying and advocating for continuous evaluation and improvement of institutional-wide vision, mission, and goals that support student learning and development. <input type="checkbox"/> The instructor actively mentors and motivates colleagues to participate in institutional leadership roles.	<input type="checkbox"/> The instructor engages in institutional-wide decision-making processes with colleagues to identify common goals, develop strategies for pursuing these goals, and evaluate progress towards them. <input type="checkbox"/> The instructor actively and consistently contributes to the growth of others through mentoring, feedback, and sharing of practices.	<input type="checkbox"/> The instructor participates in school-wide efforts to implement a shared vision and they actively contribute to a supportive and collaborative institutional culture .	<input type="checkbox"/>	<p><i>Instructor Foci:</i></p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> -Civic Engagement -Intercultural Competency -Holism <p><i>Learner Foci:</i> (see Learner Tier)</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> -Civic Engagement -Intercultural Competency -Holism

Guideline	Levels of Development			N/O	Suggested Educated Citizen Focus Area(s)
	Level 3	Level 2	Level 1		
<p>3) <i>Instructor conducts evidence-based practice and/or scholarly projects that improve the quality of education</i></p> <p>(Core Guideline)</p>	<p><input type="checkbox"/> The instructor works collaboratively to conduct evidence-based practice and/or scholarly projects that have an impact on one's educational discipline and/or educational theories, practices, and/or policies more broadly. The instructor works to disseminate the results of these projects via presentations and/or publications.</p>	<p><input type="checkbox"/> The instructor collaborates with colleagues at their institution to jointly conduct evidence-based practice and/or scholarly projects that improve teaching/learning for their own classes and/or the institution as a whole.</p>	<p><input type="checkbox"/> The instructor works to improve their instructional practices through evidence-based practice and/or scholarship projects.</p>	<p><input type="checkbox"/></p>	<p><i>Instructor Foci:</i></p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> -Critical Thinking -Civic Engagement -Communication <p><i>Learner Foci: (see Learner Tier)</i></p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> -Critical Thinking -Civic Engagement -Communication
<p><u>General Comments/Recommendations:</u> [Be sure to include concrete details to support your statements. Following best practices for feedback, comments should be: a) positive; b) related to specific criteria above, and c) provide suggestions for how to improve (even for Level 3 development).]</p>					

N/O – Not Observed; KSAs* - Knowledge, Skills, and/or Attitudes;